

# Western Regional Meeting

March 25-26, 2019 Huntington Beach, CA





# Measuring the Impact of FHA's Collateral Risk Assessment Policies

#### Presenters:

- Elly Johnson, All Reverse Pro, Hiram, GA
- Britany Luth, Finance of America Reverse, Tulsa, OK
- Erik Richard, Class Valuation, Van Nuys, CA





- ☐ What do we know?
- ☐ Where do we go from here?





5 months of data from 5-7 lenders

Evaluated over 5700 loans

Tracking the following data:

- ☐ 2<sup>nd</sup> Appraisals
- ☐ Property Types- SF, 2-4, MH
- ☐ Location types-Rural, Urban, Suburban
- ☐ Loan Purpose- Traditional, H2H, H4P
- ☐ By State





## How many loans required a 2<sup>nd</sup> appraisal?

	2nd Appraisal Re		
<u>Date</u>	<u>No</u>	<u>Yes</u>	% Requiring
Oct-18	519	142	21%
Nov-18	1,061	347	25%
Dec-18	930	347	27%
Jan-19	1,026	369	26%
Feb-19	722	255	26%
Total	4,258	1,460	<b>26</b> %





How different are the values when a 2<sup>nd</sup> is required?

DIFFERENCE	Oct-18	Nov-18	Dec-18	Jan-19	Feb-19	Total
2nd<1st by more than 10%	16%	23%	22%	22%	26%	22%
2nd<1st by 5-10%	19%	14%	14%	12%	16%	14%
2nd<1st by 2-5%	16%	10%	8%	14%	5%	11%
2nd<1st by less than 2%	7%	10%	10%	7%	15%	9%
2nd = 1st	6%	5%	5%	5%	2%	5%
2nd>1st by less than 2%	10%	11%	10%	10%	13%	10%
2nd>1st by 2-5%	9%	10%	10%	11%	11%	10%
2nd>1st by 5-10%	8%	9%	9%	7%	10%	8%
2nd>1st more than 10%	10%	8%	11%	11%	2%	10%
Total	100%	100%	100%	100%	100%	100%





# Collateral Risk Assessment 2<sup>nd</sup> Appraisal Stats

- □ 56% of the cases that required a second appraisal had a lower value for the second valuation
- $\square$  22% of the cases the 2<sup>nd</sup> valuation was more than 10% lower than the first
- □ 14% the valuation was 5-10% lower than the first
- ☐ *On average*, the second appraisals were 2.6% lower than the first appraisals
- □ 10% of the loans had a 2<sup>nd</sup> valuation that came in *more* than 10% higher than the first
- □ 5% of the loans the second valuation was equal to the first valuation





## **Property Type**

Month	2-4 Fam	Condo	МН	PUD	SFR
Oct-18	1.5%	2.4%	2.0%	2.1%	92.0%
Nov-18	1.3%	2.1%	1.7%	3.3%	91.4%
Dec-18	1.3%	1.3%	2.9%	2.2%	92.3%
Jan-19	1.7%	2.2%	2.2%	2.4%	91.4%
Feb-19	1.2%	1.1%	2.9%	2.3%	92.4%
Total	1.4%	1.8%	2.3%	2.5%	91.9%





#### **Property Type Stats**

- ☐ 92% of the 5700 +/- loans are for single-family residences
- □ 1.4% of the population is 2-4 unit property types and of that number, 83% required 2<sup>nd</sup> valuation
- □ 2.3% of the population is a MH, with 58% requiring a 2<sup>nd</sup> valuation





## **Location Type**

Month	Rural	Suburban	Urban	N/A
Oct-18	8.2%	66.9%	9.8%	15.1%
Nov-18	11.6%	67.3%	7.9%	13.1%
Dec-18	15.8%	63.6%	9.0%	11.6%
Jan-19	15.3%	63.7%	10.1%	11.0%
Feb-19	15.6%	66.2%	9.5%	8.7%
Total	13.7%	65.3%	9.2%	11.7%





### **Location Type Stats**

- $\square$  Almost 2/3 of the cases are in suburban locations
- ☐ 14% of the cases were rural and 45% required a 2<sup>nd</sup> valuation
- ☐ NOTE: 11.7% of the population was not identified





## **Loan Purpose/Product Type**

Month	Refi	Purchase	Traditional
Oct-18	15.7%	4.2%	79.6%
Nov-18	13.1%	3.8%	82.0%
Dec-18	11.0%	2.1%	86.8%
Jan-19	10.8%	1.4%	87.8%
Feb-19	8.7%	1.6%	89.7%
Total	11.6%	2.5%	85.5%





#### **Loan Purpose Stats**

- 86% of the cases were traditional HECMS with 25% of those requiring a second valuation
- ☐ While only 3% of the population are (H4P) purchase, 36% of those required a second valuation





#### **State Stats**

- ☐ The biggest states (with respect to the number of cases)
  - CA 18% (722)
  - FL 29% (529)
  - TX 26% (515)
- ☐ The states with the highest proportion of loans requiring a second appraisal:
  - KY (55%)
  - KS (55%)
  - LA (44%)

Note: ND was at 50%, but there were only 2 loans in the overall population





# Measuring the Impact of FHA's Collateral Risk Assessment Policies

#### Presenters:

- Elly Johnson, All Reverse Pro, Hiram, GA
- Britany Luth, Finance of America Reverse, Tulsa, OK
- Erik Richard, Class Valuation, Van Nuys, CA

